

*Diagnosing interpolation and corruption in the Consolatio ad Liuiam***Synopsis of the poem****major vocatives/addresses:**

1-12	Proem [interpolated couplets?]	3 <i>Livia</i>
13-20	Announcement of the death of Drusus	19 <i>Romane</i>
21-36	Livia's past expectations of triumph including 31-6 direct speech of Livia	22 <i>mater</i>
37-50	now, Livia, you need to grieve, despite your virtues	40 <i>Livia</i>
51-72	even the house of Augustus is susceptible to <i>Fortuna</i>	
73-88	your death is enough of woe, Drusus	73 <i>Parcae</i> , 75 <i>Druse</i>
89-100	you, Tiberius, witnessed the death, unlike your mother	89 <i>tu</i> , 100 <i>Druse</i>
101-66	Livia's response to the death 121-64 direct speech of Livia,	121, 136 <i>nate</i> , 157 <i>Nero</i> , 162 <i>Druse</i>
167-78	the body's journey to and entry into Rome	168 <i>Livia</i>
179-220	reaction in Rome and conduct of the funeral 193-6 direct speech of <i>aliquis de plebe</i>	209 <i>Caesar</i>
221-52	Tiber floods to prevent the burning of the body 233-50 direct speech of Mars, dissuading Tiberinus including 243-6 direct speech of a Fate, addressing Mars	233 <i>Tiberine</i>
251-64	narrative of the cremation	
265-82	prophecy of fame for Drusus, punishment for Germany	271 <i>Germania</i>
283-90	the temples being built for the brothers in the Forum 290 direct speech of Tiberius	
291-8	other reactions to the death 298 direct speech of <i>aliquis comitum</i>	291 <i>Druse</i>
299-328	the reactions of Antonia	299 <i>dignissima coniuge Druso</i>
329-40	the reactions of the ancestral dead to Drusus' triumphal arrival	
341-410	consolation of Livia, stressing 341-56 the obligations of her status 357-70 the mortality of all 371-92 the power of <i>Fortuna</i> and her special generosity to Livia 393-410 the heavenly signs prognosticating the death	341 <i>optima mater</i> , 350 <i>Liuiia</i>
411-16	prayer for long life for Tiberius	411 <i>tu qui superas</i>
417-26	Caesar and Tiberius stop Livia dying from grief	417 <i>tu</i> , 426 <i>Liuiia</i>
427-44	the inevitability of death illustrated from mythical and familial <i>exempla</i>	
445-70	the wish of Drusus that his mother cease mourning 447-68 direct speech of ghost of Drusus	454, 456 <i>mater</i>
471-4	final instruction, for the sake of Tiberius, and Augustus	474 <i>Liuiia</i>

Poematium hoc quantiuis pretii, et dignum genio ac maiestate saeculi Nasoniani, ... Est quidem carmen longe praestantissimum indignis modis acceptum per librariorum oscitantiam. nobis tamen uel sic curae erit, ut aliquanto emendatius in posterum legatur: quamquam in libris uetustis minimum praesidii fuit. ... uideamus si quid conferri a nobis possit ad detergendos naeuos, qui scripto pulcherrimo non pauci etiamnum adhaerent.

N. Heinsius, *praef. in elegiam de morte Drusi* (*Commentarii* ed. Leipzig, 1758, 393)

<p>Consolatio 95-100 at miseranda parens suprema neque oscula legit, frigida nec fouit membra tremente sinu; non anim(am) apposito fugient(em) exceptit hiatu, 98 nec sparsit caesas per tua membra comas. raptus es absenti, dum te fera bella morantur, utilior patriae quam tibi, Druse, tuae.</p>	<p>But your poor mother neither took final kisses nor hugged life-losing limbs in a trembling embrace; she did not receive fleeing breath in a mouth open and near, nor scatter cut hair on your limbs. You were stolen from her in her absence, while savage war detained you, of greater benefit, Drusus, to your country than to yourself.</p>
--	---

For the effective elisions in 97, as the dying man's final breath is (theroretically) received in the mother's mouth, cf. the more unusual elision in Livia's prayer at 158 *excipias hanc anim(am) ore pio*.

<p>Consolatio 133-52 hic pietatis honos? artus amplector inanes; euocat hos ipsos flamma rogosque suos. tene ego sustineo positum scelerata uidere? 136 tene meae poterunt ungere, nate, manus? nunc ego te infelix summum teneoque tuorque effingoque manus oraque ad ora fero? nunc primum aspiceris consul uictorque parenti? 140 sic mihi, sic miserae nomina tanta refers? quos primum uidi fasces, in funere uidi, et uidi euersos indiciumque mali. quis credat? matri lux haec carissima uenit, 144 qua natum in summo uidit honore suum. iamne ego non felix? iam <u>pars</u> mihi rapta Neronum, materni ceber nomine Drusus aui? iamne meus non est nec me facit ille parentem? 148 iamne fui Drusi mater et ipse fuit? nec cum uictorem referetur adesse Neronem, dicere iam potero '<u>maior an alter</u> adest?' ultima contigimus: ius matris habemus ab uno, 152 unius est munus quod tamen orba negor.</p>	<p>Is this reward for piety? I embrace lifeless limbs; the flame and their own pyre calls them up themselves. Do I as a wicked woman manage to see you buried? Can my hands annoint you, my son? Now do I unhappily hold you for the last time and see you and fondle your hands and bring lip to lip? Now are you first seen as consul and victor by your mother? Is it so that you bring back these great titles to me, to one in grief? [140] The first <i>fasces</i> I saw were those I saw at the funeral, and I saw them inverted and proof of woe. Who would believe it? This day has come most costly to a mother on which she has seen her son in the highest office. Am I now not happy? Has a part of the Neros now been snatched away from me – Drusus, celebrated by the name of his maternal grandfather. Is he now not mine, and does he not make me a parent? Is the mother of Drusus a thing of the past, and Drusus himself too? And when it is reported that the victorious Nero is on his way, shall I now not say, 'The elder or the other?' [150] We have touched the end: we have the rights of mother from one alone; it is the gift of one that though bereft I am said not to be.</p>
---	---

134 et uocat *dal Zotto*: et uorat *Heinsius* [suus] sinus *C^{mg}D^{mg}*: suos *Micyllus*: sibi *Castiglioni* et uocat hos ipso ... sinu *Heyworth* (cf. *Sen. Phoen.* 573 matresque ab ipso coniugum raptas sinu)
143 haec] sic? *an* sic lux matri? [carissima ('*contraria vult poeta*' *Heinsius*)] maestissima *ed. Aldina*: '*durissima Heinsius*' *apud Haupt et Baehrens*: clarissima *Ellis*
145 non felix] sum felix *p* (*quo accepto fort. cum pro iam*): sum infelix *Baehrens*
For 145-7 cf. *Ovid, Ars* 2.93 (and *Met.* 8.331) *pater infelix nec iam pater*.

<p>Consolatio 1-12 Visa diu felix, mater modo dicta Neronum, iam tibi <u>dimidium</u> nominis huius abest; iam <i>legis</i> in Drusum miserabile, Liuia, carmen, 4 unum qui dicat iam tibi 'mater' habes, nec tua te pietas distendit amore duorum, nec posito fili nomine dicis '<u>uter</u>'? et quisquam leges audet tibi dicere flendi? 8 et quisquam lacrimas temperat ore tuas? ei mihi, quam facile est, quamuis hic contigit omnes, alterius luctu fortia uerba loqui – scilicet exiguo percussa es fulminis ictu, 12 fortior ut possis cladibus esse tuis.</p>	<p>Having long seemed happy, you who were recently called the mother of the Neros, half of this title is now lacking to you; now you are reading a sad poem on Drusus, Livia; now you have only one to say mother to you, nor does your piety stretch you apart with love of two, nor when the title of son is used do you say 'which of the two?' [5] And does anyone dare to tell you the laws of weeping? And does anyone regulate your tears with his mouth? Alas, how easy it is (though this touches all) to speak brave words in another's time of grief – [10] presumably 'you have been hit by a small lightning strike, with the result that you can be braver than your misfortune.'</p>
---	---

5 te] se *Heinsius* [distendit] sustentat *dal Zotto*
6 dicis] quaeris *Francius*: reddis *Baehrens* [7 audet] ausit *Heinsius*
8 temperat ore tuas] temperet, oro, suas *Heinsius*: temptat habere tuas *Heyworth*
9 hic *Micyllus*: hoc Ω

<p>Consolatio 29-36 fingebas reducem praecerptaque mente fouebas gaudia et ante oculos iam tibi uictor erat: ‘Iam ueniet, iam me gratantem turba uidebit, 32 iam mihi pro Druso dona ferenda meo. obuia progrediar felixque per oppida dicar collaque et hoc oculos illius ore premam. talis erit, sic occurret, sic oscula iunget; 36 hoc mihi narrabit, sic prior ipsa loquar.’</p>	<p>You were imagining him returning and nurturing in your mind joys plucked too soon, and he was already a victor before your eyes: ‘Soon he will come, soon the crowds will see me congratulating him, soon offerings will need to be made for my Drusus. [32] I shall go out to meet him and be hailed as happy as I pass through towns, and I shall press his neck and eyes with this mouth of mine. This is how he’ll be, so he will meet me, so he will kiss me; this is the story he’ll tell me; thus shall I address him first.’</p>
---	---

29 praecerpta *Francius*: praecepta Ω

34 hoc *Heinsius*: os Ω : usque *Axelson* oculos<que> *CD*

<p>Consolatio 13-20 Occidit exemplum iuuenis uenerabile morum: <u>maximus ille</u> armis, <u>maximus ille</u> toga. ille modo eripuit latebrosas hostibus Alpes 16 et titulum belli dux duce fratre tulit: ille genus Suebos acre indomitosque Sygambros contudit inque fugam barbara terga dedit, ignotumque tibi meruit, Romane, triumphum, 20 protulit in terras imperiumque nouas.</p>	<p>There has died a man who was an admired model of good character, the greatest in arms, the greatest in a toga. Recently he snatched from the enemy their hiding places in the Alps [15] and a leader accompanied by his brother as leader he won the title of the war: he beat the Suebi, fierce race, and the unconquerable Sygambri, and turned the barbarian backs to flight, and earned a triumph unknown to you, Roman, and extended the empire into new lands.</p>
---	---

<p>Ovid, Am. 3.9.1-6 Memnona si mater, mater plorauit Achillem, et tangunt magnas tristia fata deas, flebilis indignos, Elegia, solue capillos: 4 a, nimis ex uero nunc tibi nomen erit! ille tui uates operis, tua fama, Tibullus ardet in exstructo, corpus inane, rogo. Ovid, Am. 2.6.1-2 Psittacus, Eois imitatrix ales ab Indis, occidit: exsequias ite frequenter, aues.</p>	<p>Horace, Carm. 1.24.1-6, 9-10 Quis desiderio sit pudor aut modus tam cari capitis? praecipe lugubris cantus, Melpomene, cui liquidam pater uocem cum cithara dedit. ergo Quintilium <i>perpetuus sopor</i> urget; ... multis ille bonis flebilis occidit, nulli flebilior quam tibi, Vergili. Catullus 3.1-3 Lugete, ... passer mortuus est.</p>
<p>Propertius 2.16.1-2 Praetor ab Illyricis uenit modo, Cynthia, terris, <u>maxima</u> praeda tibi, <u>maxima</u> cura mihi.</p>	<p>Consolatio 365 maximus ille quidem iuuenum spes publica uixit.</p>
<p>Ovid, Pont. 2.1.61-2 iam nunc haec a me, iuuenum belloque togaque maxime, dicta tibi uaticinante nota.</p>	

<p>Consolatio 299-310 [<i>address to Antonia</i>] quid referam de te, dignissima coniuge Druso 300 atque eadem Drusi digna parente nurus? par bene compositum: iuuenum fortissimus alter, altera tam forti mutua cura uiro. femina tu princeps, tu filia Caesaris illi 304 nec minor es magni coniuge uisa Iouis. tu confessus amor, tu solus et ultimus illi, tu requies fesso grata laboris eras. te moriens per uerba nouissima questus abesse et mota in nomen frigida lingua tuum. infelix recipis non quem promiserat ipse, 308 nec qui missus erat, nec tuus ille redit, ...</p>	<p>What am I to say of you, most worthy of Drusus as spouse, and at the same time a worthy daughter-in-law for Drusus’ mother? A well arranged pair: the one the bravest of youths, the other the mutual love of so brave a man. You to him seemed the first lady, you the daughter of Caesar, and no less than the wife of mighty Jupiter. [304] You were his acknowledged love, you his sole and final love, you a pleasing rest from labours when he was tired. As he was dying, in his final words he complained that you were absent, and his cold tongue was moved to produce your name. Unhappily you welcome home not the man he had himself promised, not the one who was sent away, nor does he return as yours ...</p>
--	---

302 tam *Heinsius*: iam Ω altera habens formae munera praecipua *Baehrens*

305 confessus *Burman*: concessus Ω

<p>Consolatio 315-32 [the Loeb text] frigidus ille tibi corpusque refertur inane, 316 quemque premat sine te sternitur ecce torus. quo raperis laniata comas similisque furenti? quo ruis? attonita quid petis ora manu? hoc fuit Andromache, cum uir religatus ad axem 320 terruit admissos sanguinolentus equos; hoc fuit Euadne tum, cum ferienda coruscis fulminibus Capaneus impauida ora dedit. quid mortem tibi maesta rogas amplexaque natos 324 pignora de Druso sola relictata tenes, et modo per somnos agitaris imagine falsa teque tuo Drusum credis habere sinu, et subito temptasque manu sperasque receptum, 328 quaeris et in uacui parte priore tori. ille pio, si non temere haec creduntur, in aruo inter honoratos excipietur auos, magnaque maternis maioribus, aequa paternis gloria quadriugis aureus ibit equis;</p>	<p>Lifeless and an empty corpse he is brought back to you, and – look – a couch is prepared for him to lie on without you. Where are you carried off to, tearing your hair, and like one raving? Where are you rushing to? Why do you attack your face with confounded hand? This was Andromache, when her blood-stained husband was bound to the chariot and terrified the galloping horses; [320] this was Evadne on the occasion when Capaneus offered his fearless face to be struck by the flashing thunderbolt. Why sadly do you ask for death for yourself and embracing your children hold the only pledges of Drusus left to you, and are you now harried in your sleep by a false image [325] and do you believe you hold Drusus in your bosom, and do you suddenly reach with your hand and hope you have got him back, and look for him in the front part of the empty bed? He will be received in the fields of the pious, if that is not a rash belief, among his glorious grand-fathers, [330] and he will advance adorned in gold on a four-horse chariot, a great glory for his maternal and equal for his paternal ancestors.</p>
--	---

319 et 321 hoc fuit] haec fuit *Maehly*: sic fuit *uel* hoc facit *Baehrens*: hoc tulit *Helm*: sic furit *Vollmer*: an sic ruit? [sic Verg. *Aen.* 10.729, Ou. *Ars* 1.97, *Ilias Lat.* 399]

319-21 Andromachae (*Philelfus*) ... Euadnae *Oldecop*: -es ... -es *Lenz*: -en ... -en *Schoonhoven*

319 axem *L*: axes *cett.*

323 quid] nunc *Gibson apud Heyworth 2020*: an tu?

<p>Consolatio 315-32 [<i>SJH text</i>] frigidus ille tibi corpusque refertur inane, 316 quemque premat sine te sternitur ecce torus. nunc mortem tibi maesta rogas amplexaque natos 324 pignora de Druso sola relictata tenes; et modo per somnos agitaris imagine falsa 326 teque tuo Drusum credis habere sinu, et subito temptasque manu sperasque receptum, 328 quaeris et in uacui parte priore tori. quo raperis laniata comas similisque furenti? 318 quo ruis? attonita quid petis ora manu? sic furit Andromache, cum uir religatus ad axes 320 terruit admissos sanguinolentus equos; sic furit Euadne tum, cum ferienda coruscis 322 fulminibus Capaneus impauida ora dedit. ille pio, si non temere haec creduntur, in aruo 330 inter honoratos excipietur auos, magnaque maternis maioribus, aequa paternis gloria quadriugis aureus ibit equis;</p>	<p>Lifeless and an empty corpse he is brought back to you, [315] and – look – a couch is prepared for him to lie on without you. Now you sadly ask for death for yourself and embracing your children [323] hold the only pledges of Drusus left to you, and now you are harried in your sleep by a false image and you believe you hold Drusus in your bosom, and suddenly you reach with your hand and hope you have got him back, and look for him in the front part of the empty bed. Where are you carried off to, tearing your hair, and like one raving? [317] Where are you rushing to? Why do you attack your face with confounded hand? So raved Andromache, when her blood-stained husband was bound to the chariot and terrified the galloping horses; so raved Evadne on the occasion when Capaneus offered his fearless face to be struck by the flashing thunderbolt. He will be received in the fields of the pious, if that is not a rash belief, among his glorious grand-fathers, [330] and he will advance adorned in gold on a four-horse chariot, a great glory for his maternal and equal for his paternal ancestors.</p>
--	--

317–22 post 328 *Heyworth 2020 (n. 16)* [*n.b.* 316 torus, 328 tori]

<p>Consolatio 375-8 [<i>Livia and Fortuna</i>] regna de(ae) immitis parce irritare querendo, sollicitare animos parce potentis erae. quae tamen hoc uno tristis tibi tempore uenit, saepe eadem rebus fauit amica tuis.</p>	<p>Avoid provoking the realm of an inexorable goddess, avoid troubling the pride of a powerful mistress. Though she has come to you full of sorrows at this one time, often too she has favoured you like a friend.</p>
--	---

Cf. *Pont.* 1.2.87 *ira uiri mitis*, 2.2.109 *mite*, *sed iratum merito mihi numen adora*, 4.5.32 *a miti Caesare*; 4.15.32 *mitis amice*.

377 tamen hoc] tamenetsi *Baehrens* [Cat. 68B.135 *quae tamen etsi uno non est contenta Catullo*]: tantum hoc?

<p>Consolatio 445-58 [from final consolation to Livia] ipse tibi emissus nebulosum in litus Auerni, 446 si liceat, forti uerba tot ore sonet: ‘quid numeras annos? uixi maturior annis. acta senem faciunt: haec numeranda tibi, his aeuum fuit implendum, non segnibus annis. 450 hostibus eueniat longa senecta meis. hoc atauit monuere mei proauique Neronis (fregerunt ambo Punica bella duces), hoc domus ista docet, per te mea, Caesaris alti. 454 exitus hic, mater, debuit esse meus. nec meritis (quamquam illa iuuant magis) afuit illis, mater, honos: titulis nomina plena uides: CONSVL ET IGNOTI VICTOR GERMANICVS ORBIS, 458 CVI FVIT (heu) MORTIS PVBLICA CAVSA legor.</p>	<p>He himself, if it were allowed, would be sent up to the cloudy shore of Avernus and utter as many words as this from his brave mouth: ‘Why do you count my years? I have lived faster than my years: achievements produce seniority: these are what you should count, it is with these that a life should be filled, not years of inactivity. May my enemies have a long old age. My great-grandfathers have provided evidence of this and my Neronian ancestors (both generals broke Carthaginian wars), this is taught by that house of yours, lofty Caesar’s, mine through you. This ought to be my end, mother. Nor do those good deeds (though they give great pleasure) lack honour, mother: you see the inscription of my name is full of titles: I am read (alas!) as ‘Consul and Germanicus, victor over a new world, a man to whom the republic was the cause of death.’</p>
---	---

445 nebulosum in litus *Schoonhoven*: nebulosum litus φ: nebulosi in litore χψ: nebuloso (*uel* nebulosi) litore *Heinsius*

446 si *V* (*per coniecturam, ut uid.*): sic Ω

450 longa] lenta *Heyworth* (*uel e.g. capta*) meis *Scaliger* [cf. *Propertius* 3.8.20 *hostibus eueniat lenta puella meis*]: metu Ω

451 mei] tui *Schoonhoven* 452 bella] castra *uel* signa *Heyworth olim*

455 illa iuuant] ipsa iuuant *Baehrens*: illa iuuat *Heinsius* (*cum obfuit iste*): illustrat *Schoonhoven* illis] istis *Gronovius*: ipsis *Castiglioni*

452 cui *Lipsius*: qui Ω

<p>Consolatio 411-20 [<i>spoken to Tiberius, then Livia</i>] at tu qui superas, maestae solacia matri, comprecor, illi ipsi conspiciare senex; perque annos diuturnus eas fratrisque tuosque 414 et uiuat nato cum sene mater anus. euentura precor: deus excusare priora dum uolet, a Druso cetera laeta dabit. tu tamen ausa potes tanto indulgere dolori, 418 longius ut nolis (heu male fortis) ali. uix etiam fueras paucas uitalis in horas, obtulit inuitae cum tibi Caesar opem.</p>	<p>You who survive, solace to your sad mother, I pray that she herself see you as an old man; and may you pass at length through the years of your brother as well as your own, and may your mother live an old woman with an old son. [414] I pray for things that shall happen: as the god will want to excuse what happened in the past, he will make everything joyful after Drusus. You, however, can daringly indulge so great a grief that you are unwilling to be nourished further (brave, alas, to unfortunate effect). [418] You scarcely had the vitality for a few hours, when Caesar offered aid against your wishes.</p>
---	--

417 tu] *fortasse* nec tamen ausa] t- usque *Heinsius*: t- ipsa *Maehly*: t- aucta *Busche*: t- icta *Lenz*: tam incauta *dal Zotto* potes] soles *Baehrens*: tuo es *Shackleton Bailey* (*cum tantum et nolles*, 418) tanto] tantum *Burman*: tanta *Vollmer* 420 cum] dum?

<p>Consolatio 255-62 [<i>Schoonhoven’s text</i>] tandem ubi complexa est siluas alimentaue sumpsit, 256 aethera subiectis lambit et astra comis, qualis in Herculeae colluxit collibus Oetae cum sunt imposito membra cremata deo. uritur heu decor ille uiri generosaeque forma 260 et facilis uultus, uritur ille uigor uictricesque manus facundaue principis ora pectoraue, ingenii magna capaxque domus.</p>	<p>When the flame at last embraced the timber and took sustenance, casting its bloom upwards it licks the sky and stars, just as it shone on the hill of Herculean Oeta when the god was placed on top and his limbs cremated. Alas, the man’s beauty is burnt and his noble form, [255] and smiling face, the familiar vigour is burnt, and the victorious hands, the prince’s eloquent lips and chest, great and capacious home of his intellect.</p>
--	---

256 subiectis] subuectis *Bentley*: subrectis *Baehrens* [cf. *Verg. Geo.* 4.385 *flamma ad summum tecti subiecta*]

258 impositi ... dei *Heyworth, ut uid.*

260 facilis φψ: faciles χ: graciles *Francius* [*facilis = comis, benignus: ThLL facilis* 62.79-63.10]

262 magna] digna? [Serv. *Aen.* 1.726 *alii atria magnas aedes et capacissimas dictas tradunt; Juv.* 12.44-5 *urnae cratera capacem | et dignum sitiente Pholo uel coniuge Fusci*]

Bibliography

editions:

- P. Burman, *P. Ovidii Nasonis Opera omnia* (4 vols; Amsterdam, 1727), 1.795-828
 M. Haupt, ‘Epicedion Drusi’, *Opuscula* (Leipzig, 1875), 315-57 [15th century]
 E. Baehrens, *Poetae Latini minores I* (Leipzig, 1879), 97-121 [authentic¹]
 H. Oldecop, *De Consolatione ad Liviam* (Diss. Göttingen, 1911) [AD 44-68]
 F. Vollmer, *Poetae Latini minores II.2* (Leipzig, 1923), 15-35 [authentic]
 A. Witlox, *Consolatio ad Liuiam prolegomenis, commentario exegetico, indice instructa* (Diss. Groningen; Maastricht, 1934) [AD 29-37]
 F. W. Lenz (2nd ed.; Turin, 1956)
 H. Schoonhoven (Groningen, 1992) [AD 54-5]
 J. Amat (Budé; Paris, 1997) [reviewed by E Courtney, *CR* 49 (1999), 397-9] [AD 6]
 A. Fraschetti, *Poesia anonima latina* (Roma, 2005) [authentic]

other works consulted, esp. those relevant to transmission, authenticity, date:

- F. T. Adler, *De P. Ovidii Nasonis, quae fertur, Consolatione ad Liuiam* (Prog. Anclam, 1851) [AD 6-29]
 B. Axelson, ‘De aetate Consolationis ad Liuiam et Elegiarum in Maecenatem’, *Eranos* (28 (1930), 1-33 [Domitianic?]
 I. Cogitore, ‘*Praecursoria consolatoria*: hypotheses de travail sur la *Consolatio ad Liuiam de morte Drusi*’, *MEFRA* 106 (1994), 1095-117 [rhetorical]
 A. Fraschetti, ‘Sulla datazione della *Consolatio ad Liviam*’, *RFIC* 123 (1995), 409-27 [authentic]
 N. Heinsius, *Commentarius in P. Ovidii Nasonis opera omnia* (3 vols, Leipzig, 1758), 1.393-402 [saeculum Ovidianum]
 S. J. Heyworth, ‘The *Consolatio ad Liuiam* and literary history’, in T. E. Franklino & L. Fulkerson (eds), *Constructing Authors and Readers in the Appendices Vergiliana, Tibulliana, and Ovidiana* (Oxford, 2020), 223-41 [authentic]
 E. Hübner, ‘Das Epicedion Drusi’, *Hermes* 13 (1878), 145-244 [AD 100-200]
 G. Liberman, ‘Observations sur le texte et la date de la *Consolatio ad Livie*’, *MEFRA* 106 (1994), 1119-36 [late antique?]
 J. Maehly, *Observationes de Drusi atque Maecenatis epicediis deque Taciteo dialogo criticae* (Basel, 1873), 3-13 [inauthentic, unspecified]
 I. Peirano, *The Rhetoric of the Roman Fake: Latin Pseudepigrapha in Context* (Cambridge, 2012) [205-41 on *Consolatio ad Liuiam* (and *El. ad Maec.*)] [rhetorical]
 M. Platnauer, *Latin elegiac verse* (Cambridge, 1951) [not Ovidian]
 R. S. Radford, ‘The *Priapea* and the Vergilian Appendix’, *TAPhA* 52 (1921), 148-77, at 169, n. 41 (without discussion) [Ovidian!]
 M. D. Reeve, ‘The tradition of *Consolatio ad Liuiam*’, *RHT* 16 (1976), 79-98 [Neronian]
 J. A. Richmond, ‘Doubtful works ascribed to Ovid’, *ANRW* II.31.4.2744-83 [2768-83 on *Consolatio ad Liuiam*] [Tiberian?]
 U. Schlegelmilch, ‘Was ist und wovon handelt die *Consolatio ad Liviam*?’, *WJA* 29 (2005), 151-84 [AD 33-8]
 P. Schrijvers, ‘À propos de la datation de la Consolation à Livia’, *Mnemosyne* 41 (1988), 381-4 [AD 20]
 F. Skutsch, ‘*Consolatio ad Liviam*’, *RE* IV (1901), 933-47 [authentic]
 M. Stachon, *Tractavi monumentum aere perennius: Untersuchungen zu vergilischen und ovidischen Pseudepigraphen* (Trier, 2014) [237-71 on *Cons.*] [after AD 13]
 F. Ursini, ‘Sul problema dell’autenticità e della datazione della *Consolatio ad Liviam*’, *Vichiana* 51 (2014), 93-120 [after AD 13; pretending to be Ovidian]

¹ By ‘authentic’ I mean ‘written in the aftermath of the funeral’, as the poem presents itself, i.e. 9-8 B.C.